

termine from what brain structures a patient's affects were emanating. Nonetheless, I do applaud him for publishing this material. Like all scientific findings, his work will have to be modified in time as we learn more; still he deserves credit for pushing through this barrier and for advancing the field in this way.

REFERENCE

Le Doux, J. E. (1996). *The emotional brain* New York: Simon & Schuster.

© PSYCHOANALYTIC BOOKS: A QUARTERLY JOURNAL OF REVIEWS

FREUDIAN ANALYSTS/FEMINIST ISSUES

by *Judith M. Hughes*

New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1999, 240 pp., \$35.00

Reviewed by Alexander Stein, M.S.Sc.

R. Buckminster Fuller once said "I don't know what I am. I know that I am not a category. I am not a thing—a noun. I seem to be a verb, an evolutionary process, an integral function of the universe." The difficulties of conforming to a definition or label of one's self, something inert and delimited, and the idea of an evolutionary continuum of theories constructed to elaborate those constructs, are central themes in Judith Hughes's interesting and well-written new book, *Freudian Analysts/Feminist Issues*. Just as Fuller chafed against the strictures of scientific orthodoxy and strove not only to find his place within a dynamic community but to expand its bounds, Hughes is an intrepid thinker set upon a course equally estimable and no less arduous.

If the fundamental quandary of woman's place in Freud's theorizing was that it occupied a "dark continent," history has seen it overshadowed by the related but more dramatic question, "what do women want?" Hughes wisely avoids attempts at concocting a reply. Instead, using a structural convention that is a flash of brilliance, and a homage to the Darwinian/Lamarckian Petri dish in which Freud's own early thinking germinated, she disengages from

the lame, tired, antiphallocentric discourse that too frequently masquerades as feminist scholarship by employing the notion of evolution, a selection process, as her book's leitmotif. Her quest is to elucidate the linkages and lineages between and among a select cadre of psychoanalytic thinkers who have inherited Freud's insights and misunderstandings about women and, thus, to illumine that continent too long perceived as dark.

Each chapter commences with an evolutionarily related supertitle, which Hughes employs as a taxonomic device to thematically catalogue each theorist in relation to the conceptual continuum. The developmental line begins with "Retgression," which is about Helene Deutsch. This is followed by "Epigenesis," which pairs Erik Erikson and Carol Gilligan. This leads to "Sexual Selection" focusing on Karen Horney, which evolves into "Artificial Selection," linking Robert Stoller and Nancy Chodorow, and concludes with the convergence of Melanie Klein and Hughes herself in a chapter supertitled "Natural Selection."

It is no easy task to create a montage composed of the works of others that is itself fresh and original but that does not mute or distort those other voices. As with any work of anthropology, which this book is, the documentarian's presence is unavoidable no matter how removed from the focus she attempts to make herself. But Hughes navigates these difficulties adroitly; she captures the tone and nuance of her interlocutors' inflection, crafting the source material as if she were conducting interviews. Rare is the paragraph that becomes Hughes's aria; almost every sentence is orchestrated to include seamlessly integrated quotations, and the result is a work that, by its conclusion, resonates with the harmonic overtones of all the combined voices.

What makes this approach so compelling is that it avoids the pitfalls of monolithic construction or destruction, that is, an enterprise designed to bolster an argument either for or against some or other epistemological totem—"feminism" or "Freudianism," "man" or "woman." As Hughes suggests, feminism has been a concept divided, perhaps it would be more accurate to say split. It has also been divisive, as expressed in Gilligan's famous enuncia-

tion of woman's different voice, something that, by definition, implies both homogeneity (among women) and heterogeneity (opposed to men). By listening closely to the chorus gathered by Hughes, it seems that the focus has shifted—evolved—such that the quality of the voice is now subordinated to the way in which it is heard.

Historically, one of the most intractable psychoanalytic conundrums has been how to devise a means of articulating, if not conceptualizing, notions of gender, gender identity, sexuality, without hewing to those threadbare schemata of oppositions—feminine versus masculine, penis versus vagina, vagina versus clitoris, psyche versus soma, and so on. The ongoing debate resounds throughout the book as a common evolutionary theme as each theorist intones his or her views. Hughes does not interpose herself as mediator; resolution of the tension engendered (pun intended) by differences of theoretical position or of voice is clearly not her goal. Indeed, rather than proposing conceptual unification, Hughes's evolutionary view is expansive, positing multiple gender identities and, extending an aspect of the Kleinian understanding that she has adopted as her own, affirming the multiplicity of sexuality. While psychoanalytic theory has traveled far from the dark continent that so frightened Freud, Hughes seems to hint to a return of sorts to the polymorphously perverse child about which Freud has written.

There are, no doubt, those who will criticize Hughes for failing to postulate the next generation of the feminist equivalent of the unified field theory. Lack of answers need not be a deprivation; rather, it provides space for further questioning. What constitutes "woman" and "man" is inimical to the human condition, and the pursuit of greater understanding is a philosophical if not nearly theological quest to which psychoanalysis has a great deal to contribute. Hughes's book is a welcome addition to that canon.

PEP-Web Copyright

Copyright. The PEP-Web Archive is protected by United States copyright laws and international treaty provisions.

1. All copyright (electronic and other) of the text, images, and photographs of the publications appearing on PEP-Web is retained by the original publishers of the Journals, Books, and Videos. Saving the exceptions noted below, no portion of any of the text, images, photographs, or videos may be reproduced or stored in any form without prior permission of the Copyright owners.

2. Authorized Uses. Authorized Users may make all use of the Licensed Materials as is consistent with the Fair Use Provisions of United States and international law. Nothing in this Agreement is intended to limit in any way whatsoever any Authorized User's rights under the Fair Use provisions of United States or international law to use the Licensed Materials.

3. During the term of any subscription the Licensed Materials may be used for purposes of research, education or other non-commercial use as follows:

a. Digitally Copy. Authorized Users may download and digitally copy a reasonable portion of the Licensed Materials for their own use only.

b. Print Copy. Authorized Users may print (one copy per user) reasonable portions of the Licensed Materials for their own use only.

Copyright Warranty. Licensor warrants that it has the right to license the rights granted under this Agreement to use Licensed Materials, that it has obtained any and all necessary permissions from third parties to license the Licensed Materials, and that use of the Licensed Materials by Authorized Users in accordance with the terms of this Agreement shall not infringe the copyright of any third party. The Licensor shall indemnify and hold Licensee and Authorized Users harmless for any losses, claims, damages, awards, penalties, or injuries incurred, including reasonable attorney's fees, which arise from any claim by any third party of an alleged infringement of copyright or any other property right arising out of the use of the Licensed Materials by the Licensee or any Authorized User in accordance with the terms of this Agreement. This indemnity shall survive the termination of this agreement. NO LIMITATION OF LIABILITY SET FORTH ELSEWHERE IN THIS AGREEMENT IS APPLICABLE TO THIS INDEMNIFICATION.

Commercial reproduction. No purchaser or user shall use any portion of the contents of PEP-Web in any form of commercial exploitation, including, but not limited to, commercial print or broadcast media, and no purchaser or user shall reproduce it as its own any material contained herein.